



MICHIGAN CITY INDIANA

Planning Department ~ Skyler York, Planning Director ~ ph: 219-873-1419 ~ fax: 219-873-1580 ~ syork@emichigancity.com

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Monday, September 27, 2021
City Hall – Mayor’s Conference Room – 6:00 P.M. CST
- MEETING MINUTES-

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by President Joyce Dalton at 6:00 PM.

MODIFICATION OF AGENDA:

Motion was made by Dan Granquist and seconded by Roger Potratz to correct the address of **COA 2021-044** from **710 E 10th Street** to **712 E 10th Street**, and to re-arrange the agenda order to move **COA 2021-039** first in the COA section and **COA 2021-043** second, then **COA 2021-039** third and the remainder of the COA’s in order as shown on the agenda.

All members present concurred. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Roger Potratz, Amy Bowman, David Augustus; Nays: None. ∴ Motion Passed.

INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS TO NEW COMMISSIONER:

Amy Bowman was introduced by President Joyce Dalton as a New Historic Preservation Commission Commissioner and all Commissioners introduced themselves to Amy Bowman.

ROLL CALL

VOTING MEMBERS

Joyce Dalton
Dan Granquist
Roger Potratz
David Augustus
Amy Bowman
John Hendricks

VOTING MEMBERS ABSENT

Anthony Holt
Dwayne Hurt

ADVISORY MEMBERS PRESENT:

Deb Parcell
Lilliana Rosado

CITY COUNSEL LIASON: Bryant Dabney – absent

VISITORS: On Sign In Sheet with Lilliana Rosado

DUANE PARRY – MAYOR

City of Michigan City ~ City Hall ~ 100 East Michigan Boulevard, Michigan City, IN 46360 ~ ph: 219-873-1400 ~ fax: 219-873-1515
web: emichigancity.com ~ e-mail: mayorparry@emichigancity.com

APPROVAL OF AUGUST 23, 2021 MEETING MINUTES:

Motion to approve minutes made by Dan Granquist and seconded by David Augustus. All members present concurred. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Roger Potratz, Amy Bowman, David Augustus; Nays: None. :::: Motion Passed.

CORRESPONDENCE:

None

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

- 1) **COA 2021- 039 221 E. 6th St. – Attempt was made to call the Window World representative with no success, so we moved to COA 2021-043**

- 2) **COA 2021-043 110 W. 9th St – A phone call was made to the petitioner, Mr. Tim Enright, of this COA to discuss the project during the meeting.**
Local landmark or district: Franklin Street Local and National Register District
Rating: Contributing
Architectural style: Italianate
Date constructed: 1882
Property description: The cube-shaped building is two stories tall and has an ell on its southeast corner. The building's foundation is composed of stone and its walls are composed of brick. Three original four-over-four, double-hung windows remain on the first story of the facade. The windows have stone sills and segmented arches composed of bricks. The double wood door entry with transom above, is located on the north side of the ell, with an original arched wood window aligned above. The cornice is composed of rows of dentils and decorative wood brackets that support wide overhanging eaves. The building's hipped roof is covered in rubber and is topped with a square cupola.
Proposed project: Remove decorative paired wood brackets and replace with aluminum soffit.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION(S):

As removal of the paired wood brackets is not consistent with the guidelines which state they should be retained, denial is recommended.

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Enright stated that he has had several contractors bid the work to replace the paired wood brackets and most bids were over \$50,000, which is not in the budget for this work. He stated the brackets are made of wood and 10-20% of them are rotted and need replaced. He estimated there are 144 brackets. He was asked if there is a synthetic option for the brackets and he was not aware of it, nor were the contractors. The contractors bid was based on them cutting in soffit around the brackets. No contractors wanted to remove and replace the brackets.

A motion was made by Dan Granquist to deviate from the staff recommendations and allow the reconstruction without the paired wood brackets, but it gained no second to the motion.

The commissioners felt the paired wood brackets is what gave this contributing structure its character and wanted to see them refurbished.

Roger Potratz offered his services to Mr. Enright to investigate alternatives to keep the paired wood brackets or refurbish them. The issue was tabled at this meeting until next month. Mr. Potratz will not be able to vote on the subject next month due to this new conflict of interest. Amy Bowman thought they might also be able to get advice from the group currently doing work on the Barker Mansion.

There was a motion to table this COA until the next meeting by Roger Potratz and seconded by David Augustus.

All members present concurred. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Roger Potratz, Amy Bowman, David Augustus; Nays: None. ::: Motion Passed.

3) COA 2021- 039 221 E. 6th St. – Second attempt was made to call the Window World representative with success, so we discussed this COA.

Local landmark or district: Elston Grove Local and National Register Historic Districts

Rating: Non-Contributing

Architectural style: Gable Front (converted carriage house)

Date constructed: 1902

Property description: The subject property is a 1-1/2 story frame house. It has an asphalt shingled gable roof and 1/1 double-hung windows.

Proposed project: Remove 14 replacement windows and install new vinyl replacement windows.

Evaluation: While vinyl windows are forbidden in the historic district, the original windows no longer exist, and have been replaced with vinyl units. The owner proposes replacement in-kind of the existing windows.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION(S):

The first and best recommendation would be replacement with wood windows; however, as the original windows no longer exist, replacement of existing vinyl windows with new vinyl units of the same size, color, and style could be approved, as it is an in-kind replacement.

DISCUSSION:

None.

There was a motion to approve the staff recommendation by David Augustus and seconded by Dan Granquist.

All members voted. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Amy Bowman, David Augustus; Nays: Roger Potratz. ::: Motion Passed.

4) COA 2021-038 315 E. 9th St–

Local landmark or district: Elston Grove Local and National Register Historic Districts

Rating: Contributing

Architectural style: Queen Anne/Gable Front

Date constructed: 1902

Property description: The subject property is a 2-story structure with clapboard siding, brick foundation, and asphalt shingle roof. The house has 1/1 windows and a

two-story bay window on the front facade. A front porch with wood floor and asphalt shingled hip roof wraps around the east corner of the house. The front gable wall is covered with wood shingles.

Proposed project: Replace front porch steps. Existing stairs were over 50 years old, wood was rotted and stairs were unsafe. The petitioner, Mr. Falatovics, began the work to replace with an appropriate design and had been cited.

Evaluation: Balusters and steps meet historic district standard in material and design. New wood will be painted white.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION(S):

Approval as submitted.

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Falatovics was planning on adding balusters to the existing set of stairs as well. Neither set of stairs had balusters prior, but adjacent houses did have balusters. He also is using treated wood.

There was a motion to approve the staff recommendation by Roger Potratz and seconded by John Hendricks.

All members present concurred. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Roger Potratz, Amy Bowman, David Augustus; Nays: None. ::: Motion Passed.

- 5) **COA 2021-040 622-624 Franklin St– This COA will need to be postponed as ideas for entry repair and improvement are discussed. Roger Potratz has some ideas for the petitioner.**

DISCUSSION: A door mat was already discussed as an alternative. There are some non-slip coatings that can be applied and or inserts for the tile.

There was a motion to table this COA until the next meeting by Roger Potratz and seconded by David Augustus.

All members present concurred. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Roger Potratz, Amy Bowman, David Augustus; Nays: None. ::: Motion Passed.

- 6) **COA 2021-042 212 W. 10th St.**

Local landmark or district: Washington Street Local and Haskell & Barker National Register Districts

Rating: Contributing

Architectural style: Queen Anne

Date constructed: 1908 (Mary Kellstrom, petitioner, stated it was constructed in 1883)

Property description: The subject property is a 2 story brick house set upon a brick foundation. It has an asphalt shingled gable roof. Windows are 1/1 double hung with stone sills and lintels. There are two front doors.

Proposed project: Carport was built in the mid-sixties. Indiana winters had taken a toll on the structure. Posts and planks were rotted and deteriorated. The owner worried the carport would collapse with another winter.

Evaluation: The carport is not original to the historic structure, is located in the rear, and is not visible from the street. Replacement of existing deteriorated carport with in-kind materials meets the Historic District guidelines.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION(S):

Approval as submitted.

DISCUSSION:

Mary Kellstrom is using treated wood and has a very precise builder, Jeff Taylor.

There was a motion to approve the staff recommendation by Dan Granquist and seconded by Roger Potratz.

All members voted. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Amy Bowman, David Augustus, Roger Potratz; Nays: None. ∴ Motion Passed.

7) COA 2021-044 712 E. 10th St.

Local landmark or district: Elston Grove Local and National Register District

Rating: Non-Contributing

Architectural style: T-Plan

Date constructed: 1908

Property description: The subject property is a 1-1/2 story frame house set upon a stone foundation with an asphalt shingle gable roof. A small porch with shed roof is on the east side of the front facade. Windows are 1/1 double hung.

Proposed project: Remove ramp and replace with wood steps. (work done; permission given by building inspectors after the Inspection Department said no work should commence)

Remove rear deck/stairs; build new two-story wood deck.

Paint front door SW 6510, Loyal Blue.

Install white vinyl shutters on front windows.

Evaluation: 1) Wood steps are appropriate with wood porch deck.

2) Paint color is not from the pre-approved color palette, but is acceptable for the front door.

3) Shutters must be sized as outlined in the guidelines and made of wood.

4) Deck cannot be seen from the street.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION(S):

1) Retroactive approval of the wood steps as they meet the guidelines and were mistakenly allowed by building department employees.

2) Approval of paint as submitted.

3) Approval of shutters with the condition they be made of wood and sized to cover half the width of the window, with straight tops

4) Approval of wood deck as submitted, as it is not visible from the street.

DISCUSSION:

Treated wood is being used for this project.

Roger Potratz is concerned the building code will not be sufficient for a wooden deck and recommended the deck be built per IRC loading standards for wooden decks to withstand more load.

There was a motion to approve the staff recommendation 1) by Roger Potratz and seconded by Dan Granquist.

All members voted. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Amy Bowman, David Augustus, Roger Potratz; Nays: None. ∴ Motion Passed.

There was a motion to approve the staff recommendation 2) by Roger Potratz and seconded by David Augustus.

All members voted. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Amy Bowman, David Augustus, Roger Potratz; Nays: None. ∴ Motion Passed.

There was a motion to approve the staff recommendation 3) by David Augustus and seconded by John Hendricks.

All members voted. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Amy Bowman, David Augustus, Roger Potratz; Nays: None. ∴ Motion Passed.

There was a motion by Roger Potratz and seconded by Dan Granquist to approve the staff recommendation 4) with an additional recommendation by the commission to build per the more conservative specification with a higher load rating of IRC for exterior decks.

All members voted. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Amy Bowman, David Augustus, Roger Potratz; Nays: None. ∴ Motion Passed.

8) COA 2021-045 401 E. 7th St.

Local landmark or district: Elston Grove Local and National Register District

Rating: Outstanding

Architectural style: Italianate

Date constructed: 1880

Property description: The subject property is a 2-story brick house set upon a brick foundation. The asphalt shingle gable roof has wide overhanging eaves that are supported by pairs of decorative wood brackets with a freeze board underneath. The front doorway is recessed with two wood doors in the doorway. Windows are 6/6.

Proposed project: New front entrance doors. 7 new windows. Replace existing wood window sills with limestone when windows are installed. New fence to replace wood picket fence.

Evaluation: Existing doors are not original; new wood doors in same height and width meet the guidelines.

Existing windows are not original or sized properly; new black aluminum-clad double-hung wood windows will be sized to fit openings. Limestone sills will replace existing wood. Seven windows are proposed to be replaced on first-floor. Proposed windows meet the guidelines for size, style, and material.

Black powdered-coated aluminum fence, 6' tall, proposed to replace existing wood picket fence - height, material, and location meet the guidelines.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION(S):

Approval as submitted for windows, doors, and fence.

DISCUSSION:

Building code requires the fence not be placed in front of the front plane of the house. The petitioner was going to request a variance to install a fence past the plane of the front of the house.

There was a motion to approve the staff recommendation with the exception that the newly installed fence not be located in front of the front face of the house by John Hendricks and seconded by Roger Potratz.

All members voted. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Amy Bowman, David Augustus, Roger Potratz; Nays: None. ∴ Motion Passed.

MAINTENANCE REVIEW:

- COA 2021-037 621 Pine St. - Staff approved.
- COA 2021-041 519 E 10th St. - Staff approved.
- COA 2021-046 205 E 10th St. - Staff approved.
- COA 2021-047 810 Wabash St. - Staff approved.

There were no motions to rescind any of the aforementioned staff approvals.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

- None

OLD (TABLED) BUSINESS:

- Comments for the new guidelines for the historic preservation guidelines were sent back to Dan Granquist in response to his comments and he will review and get back with Deb Parcell. Deb Parcell will email out the final revision prior to our next HPC meeting for review. A final decision of acceptance of the new HPC guidelines will be made at the 10/26/21 meeting.
- Joyce Dalton did contact the City Attorney regarding our concern that our recommendations are not being followed when doing work in the Historic Districts. Lilliana Rosado also discussed with the City Attorney. The City Attorney stated that a proposed new COA form will have a statement that says something to the effect, "I swear under penalty of perjury that the work I propose to do is the work that will be conducted per the recommendations of the approval of the COA". The COA is our legally binding document. Deb Parcell said this is an issue that exists across most HPC's, and if we want to insure compliance, we should review work that was completed in person by driving by the jobsite. In any event, it is the homeowner or contractor that is liable for the work that is completed.

NEW BUSINESS:

- The annual amount of \$7500 was approved by the Michigan City Common Council for the work of Indiana Landmarks supporting the HPC
- We should get a list of all property owners within the historic district and do a mass mailing, or e-mailing or flyer in a water bill about the HPC, and the requirements of a COA and to thank the homeowners for the work they do to keep the historic nature of the districts.
- Deb Parcell made some general comments:
 - o Deb attended a training session recently and they discussed information about rules, regulations, open door rules, etc. that she will discuss at our next monthly meeting.
 - o They also thought it would be a good idea for the HPC to report progress and status to the MC Common Council annually to let them know the work we have been doing on the commission.
- Roger Potratz thought it was unfortunate that the old church on 11th St was torn down for the new Double Track project. The commission had remembered that a Section 106 study was completed for the Double Track project, but still thought is sad to lose the historical building.
- David Augustus brought up that the RDC has issued an RFP for the station block building and expected the HPC to participate in the Meet and Greet with the potential developers. John Hendricks remembered that the Meet and Greet is scheduled for 10/7 and will get the commission some information.
-

PUBLIC COMMENT:

None

ADJOURNEMENT:

- There was a motion to adjourn the meeting by Dan Granquist and seconded by David Augustus.
All members voted. Ayes: Joyce Dalton, Dan Granquist, John Hendricks, Amy Bowman, David Augustus, Roger Potratz; Nays: None. ∴ Motion Passed.
- Joyce Dalton adjourned the meeting at 7:27 PM